

## IN THE DISTRICT COURT OF THE FIFTH JUDICIAL DISTRICT OF THE STATE OF IDAHO, IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF TWIN FALLS

In Re PRBA	ORDER DENYING MOTION TO QUASH SUBPOENA
Case No. 59576	) SUBCASE NO.(s): 87-12164

## I. Procedural Background

A Subpoena was issued on Oct. 2, 2025 to Myron Emerson. The Subpoena was for the purpose of inspecting T40N, R04W, Section 2. On October 14, 2025, Richard Emerson filed a letter stating an objection to the Subpoena because the claimant, Nez Perce Tribe, claimed a water right in Section 11, not Section 2. The Court indicated it was treating the letter as a Motion to Quash Subpoena and set the Motion for hearing. Order Setting Hearing on Motion to Quash Subpoena (Oct. 14, 2025).

The Nez Perce Tribe filed a Response to Objection to Subpoena for Inspection of Premises (Oct. 23, 2025). In addition, the Nez Perce Tribe filed the Affidavit of Allison Lebeda.

## II. Argument

The Response argued that Richard Emerson could not represent his father Myron Emerson unless he was an attorney. The Tribe moved to strike the Motion to Quash Subpoena. In addition, the Response explained that the Tribe sought the inspection of Section 2 after it had done an inspection of Section 11. During that inspection, the tribe did not find any spring in Section 11. However, the Affidafit of Allison Lebeda stated that during the site visit of Section 11, Ms. Lebeda visually identified on Section 2 some wetland plant species which she could see from her vantage point in Section 11. There were additional features of the land in Section 2

which led Ms. Lebeda to conclude that there could be a spring in Section 2.

During oral argument at the hearing on October 29, 2025, counsel for the Nez Perce Tribe argued that IRCP 26 and IRCP 45 permit an inspection of the land in Section 2. The Tribe asked to visually inspect the land, to photograph the area and any water present, to catalog the vegetation present, and to take one small soil sample with a garden trowel.

At the hearing, Garrett Kitamura entered an oral notice of limited appearance as attorney for Mr. Emerson. Mr. Kitamura endorsed the contents of the letter from Mr. Richard Emerson except the argument that inspections of land are limited to site those conducted by the Idaho Department of Water Resources. Therefore, the request to strike the *Motion to Quash* was denied.

The Court held that no part of the proposed inspection appeared unreasonable, or created an undue burden on Mr. Emerson. The Court found that the inspection could go forward, at a time the parties could agree. Therefore, the Court **denied** the *Motion to Quash Subpoena*.

Subsequently, the parties notified the Court that the inspection could go forward on November 7 at 3:00 p.m.

Therefore, IT IS ORDERED that the inspection of T40N, R04W, Section 2 shall go forward. The Tribe shall have two people at the inspection to determine whether a spring is present. The Tribe may observe, make notes, catalog plant species, and take photographs. Mr. Emerson and a representative may be present during the inspection as well. They may observe, take notes, catalog plant species and take photographs as well.

If any soil samples are taken, the Tribe shall return the soil to its natural condition.

THEREFORE, the *Motion to Quash Subpoena* is **Denied**; it is FURTHER ORDERED that the inspection in T40N, R04W, Section 2 shall go forward on **November 7, 2025.** 

DATED: October 31, 2025.

BRIGETTE BILYEU

Special Master

Palouse River Basin Adjudication

## CERTIFICATE OF MAILING

I certify that a true and correct copy of the ORDER DENYING MOTION TO QUASH SUBPOENA was mailed on October 31, 2025, with sufficient first-class postage to the following:

CHARLIE S BASER 601 W BANNOCK ST PO BOX 2720 BOISE, ID 83701-2720 Phone: 208-388-1200

CHIEF NATURAL RESOURCES DIV OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL STATE OF IDAHO PO BOX 83720 BOISE, ID 83720-0010 Phone: 208-334-2400

GARRETT M KITAMURA
PARSONS BEHLE & LATIMER
800 W MAIN STREET STE 1300
BOISE, ID 83702
Phone: 208-562-4900

MICHAEL A LOPEZ
NEZ PERCE TRIBE LEGAL COUNSEL
100 AGENCY RD
PO BOX 305
LAPWAI, ID 83540
Phone: 208-843-7355

MICHAEL P LAWRENCE 601 W BANNOCK ST PO BOX 2720 BOISE, ID 83701-2720 Phone: 208-388-1200

NORMAN M SEMANKO
PARSONS BEHLE & LATIMER
800 W MAIN STREET STE 1300
BOISE, ID 83702
Phone: 208-562-4900

THOMAS MURPHY
NATIVE AMERICAN RIGHTS FUND
250 ARAPAHOE AVE
BOULDER, CO 80302
Phone: 303-447-8760

DIRECTOR OF IDWR PO BOX 83720 BOISE, ID 83720-0098 cc: Myron R Emerson 1030 Bollar Road Potlotch, Id. 83855

ORDER DENYING
Page 3 10/31/25

FILE COPY FOR 00201

Deputy Clerk